

del relat biogràfic, i el de Maribel Ripoll per a Illa Edicions (14), que es proposa com una guia introductòria a la figura de Llull, formada per una part expositiva sobre la seva vida i l'Art i per una breu antologia de textos lul·lians. Per últim, cal citar el llibre electrònic *Ramon Llull a la Biblioteca de Catalunya* (24), que ofereix una presentació general de Llull i de diversos aspectes de la seva producció a partir de la combinació de diferents formats —imatges, vídeos, textos descriptius, entrevistes, lectures—, i es clou amb una ressenya interactiva de l'ampli fons lul·lià de la Biblioteca de Catalunya.

Aquesta selecció de publicacions és una mostra sintètica però representativa de la gran varietat d'edicions i d'estudis lul·lians publicats l'any 2015 i bona part del 2016. Sens dubte, la commemoració de l'Any Llull ha posat de manifest la vitalitat del lul·lisme, no només en terres catalanes, sinó també en l'àmbit internacional.

The Troubadours in Catalonia and Italy

CHARMAINE LEE

University of Salerno, Department of Humanities
cleec@unisal.it

1. BELTRAN, MARTÍNEZ & CAPDEVILA (2014): Vicenç Beltran, Tomàs Martínez i Irene Capdevila (eds.), *800 anys després de Muret. Els trobadors i les relacions catalanooccitanes*, Barcelona: Universitat de Barcelona.
2. RESCONI (2014): Stefano Resconi, *Il canzoniere trobadorico U. Fonti, canone, stratigrafia linguistica*, Tavarnuzze-Impruneta: SISMEL.
3. SIMÓ (2012): Meritxell Simó, *Jaume Massó i Torrents: La cançó provençal en la literatura catalana cent anys després*, Tavarnuzze-Impruneta: SISMEL.

The three books reviewed here are all published one way or another under the auspices of the *Corpus des troubadours*, sponsored by the Institut d'Estudis Catalans, along with the Union académique internationale, and the Fondazione Ezio Franceschini for the books by Simó and Resconi. Moreover, though quite different as to their contents and approach, all deal with the late reception of troubadour poetry and its influence on the literary traditions of those two areas most affected by the so-called diaspora of the troubadours following the Albigensian Crusade: Catalonia and Italy. The aftermath of the crusade was widely perceived by the poets at the time, as well as by many modern scholars, as the beginning of the end for troubadour poetry. Nevertheless, as Vicenç Beltran argues in the introduction to the miscellaneous volume *800 anys després de Muret*:

les commocions polítiques i socials no arrosseguen inevitablement els moviments culturals, i l'agonia d'Occitània es perllongà durant gairebé cent anys; al llarg d'aquest període, l'expansió de la cultura cortesa, que a la fi del segle XII havia arribat a Castella, Alemanya, França, el nord d'Itàlia i Aragó, fou consolidada en tot el territori europeu: la diàspora dels exiliats, resultat inevitable de la desfeta, féu dispersar els trobadors i estengué el seu missatge. (p. 9)

The essays in the volume edited by Beltran, Martínez and Capdevila illustrate this from the perspective of the defeat at Muret in 1213 and how this would lead to the formation of a common Occitan-Catalan cultural space as the interests of the Crown of Aragon turned away from Provence and Montpellier; indeed, as Josep Antoni Aguilar argues in the first chapter (ps. 13-52), Catalan chronicles (the *Llibre dels fets*, Desclot and Muntaner) on the whole tend to underplay or ignore the defeat at Muret in order to show the house of Barcelona in a positive light. This shift in geo-political interest is approached in different ways by Beltran (ps. 53-73) and Saverio Guida (ps. 149-170), as well as by Marjolaine Raguin on the basis of the terms referring to Catalonia and Aragon in the *Canso de la Crozada* (ps. 221-246). The *Canso* and the effects of the Crusade are discussed in more detail by Gérard Gouiran (ps. 131-148) and Anna M. Mussons Freixas (ps. 205-220), while the consolidation of a common cultural space astride the Pyrenees emerges from the more literary contributions by Maria Luisa Meneghetti (ps. 195-204), Valeria Bertolucci (ps. 75-99) and Simone Ventura (ps. 247-268), whose discussion of the anonymous fourteenth-century *Palaytz de Savieza*, confirms the importance of the lyric tradition a hundred years after Muret and at a court such as that of Gaston Fébus, Count of Foix. Given the existence of this common cultural space, Germà Colòn looks at whether Occitan and Catalan constitute a common language (ps. 123-130), arguing for an affinity and reciprocal influence between the languages during the Middle Ages, while for the modern period «panoccitanisme» is more an outdated Romantic myth associated with the Félibrige movement. This latter is also evoked in the only contribution devoted entirely to the modern period, Johan Mahiques Climent's examination of the so-called «fêtes latines» held in Montpellier in 1878 (ps. 171-193) as part of the celebration of the 'Latin' race as a reaction to the Franco-Prussian war. A lasting result of this movement was the founding of the *Société pour l'étude des langues romanes* in 1869, along with the journal *Revue des langues romanes*.

Probably the key contribution to this volume, which sums up most of the others, is the one by Miriam Cabré and Marina Navàs on the *Poètica occitana després de Muret* (ps. 101-122). The authors point to the Italian school of Occitan studies as perpetrating the view, which they sum up ironically in their title: «Que'l rey frances nos ha dezeretatz», a quote from a *sirventes* probably by Peire de Ladils (BPP 558, 16). They rather stress the importance of the «espai occitanocatalà» in the thirteenth and fourteenth centuries as a time of renewal, when tastes had changed and the leading cultural centres had shifted to the Aragonese court,

Toulouse and the court at Foix. Poets such as Cerverí, Guiraut Riquer and At de Mons have more in common with each other than with Arnaut Daniel, for example, a fact that also emerges from Valeria Bertolucci's paper, to which Cabré and Navàs refer as they talk of «lírica del consell» and underscore the links between these late poets and the courts. I would tend to agree with this view of the evolution of Occitan literature and would add that a further sign of the shift in tastes is the appearance of narrative texts, the romances of *Jaufre* and *Flamenca* along with others, mostly transmitted by manuscripts from this same region, or the compilation of a *chansonnièr* such as R, which contains a large number of narrative texts. On the whole, these latter are not included in the Italian songbooks that present the Occitan tradition as embodied by the *canço*. This probably explains why the Italian school views any divergence from this norm, which would later shape Italian poetry, as a sign of decadence. Political poetry, too, as practiced by the later troubadours, does not fit the pattern and was excluded from the Italian canon. However, in Occitania, in the «espai occitanocatalà», the norm had evolved as is clear from Guilhem Molinier's *Leys d'amors*, which tends to prefer a poet such as At de Mons to the 'classic' troubadours (p. 106). Confirmation of Cabré's and Navàs's remarks now comes from the almost contemporary book *Parrots and Nightingales* by Sarah Kay (2013), a masterful study of quotations of troubadour poetry in later Occitan, Catalan, and Italian authors, and how these led to changes in the Western European lyric canon. I mention this book here because in fact it supports not only Cabré's and Navàs's conclusions but also those of this entire collection of essays, while also introducing the other two volumes under review here.

Jaume Massó i Torrent's *La Cançó provençal en la literatura catalana* moves along the same path that would later be followed by Kay, and Meritxell Simó's reedition of the book is thus very timely. Simó's work not only makes this important study available to the public once more but also provides a detailed introduction to Massó i Torrent's research into the reception of the troubadours by Catalan poets up to the sixteenth century. This new edition is also accompanied by a complete bibliographical update of all the topics covered, as well as notes offering information on the dates of the troubadours quoted, on manuscripts and critical editions, and on other works in which they appear, thus giving some idea as to the success of each poet. Massó's book is divided into different sections according to how the troubadours are represented: texts quoting troubadours, troubadours copied in Catalan manuscripts, influence of troubadours in prose and verse works. A series of indexes of the authors quoted completes his work, again divided into different categories: non-Catalan troubadours, Catalan troubadours, poets from the Toulouse school, Catalan poets (*i. e.*, no longer considered troubadours), French poets, Castilian poets, first lines of anonymous poems. Each quotation is numbered in progressive order throughout the book regardless of sections, thus facilitating consultation of the indexes.

Not surprisingly, perhaps, the overall conclusion is that the most quoted troubadour is Bernart de Ventadorn, the same conclusion as Kay's despite the

fact that the two corpora examined do not entirely overlap. Massó's was a pioneering work which has probably not been given the credit it deserves, especially in editions of troubadours, as has been pointed out by Stefano Asperti, for example (xiv). Thus, Simó's edition is a welcome addition to research tools in Occitan, which also focuses on the close links between the Occitan and Catalan traditions from the thirteenth and fourteenth centuries; Catalan poetry both preserved and renewed the Occitan tradition, to refer to what Kay has to say about quotation as an «engine of change» (p. 2). Although Kay's study includes such works as the *Breviari* and the *Leys d'amors* as examples of Occitan texts seeking to regenerate Occitan culture in Occitania (p. 158), it is in Catalonia and Italy that quotation in its broader sense is practiced the most: Massó i Torrent's work illustrates this for Catalonia, while the situation in Italy is to some extent an important aspect of Stefano Resconi's study of *Chansonnier U* (Florence, Biblioteca Medicea Laurenziana, Pl. 41. 43).

This latter is an excellent example of the Italian school of philology, in particular of material philology. The book is accompanied by a CD-Rom which contains the diplomatic transcription of the manuscript and a detailed record of each poem. The main part of the study is taken up by a discussion of the manuscript's sources, comparing each poem with its stemma in the editions, or collating it with the critical apparatus if the stemma is untrustworthy or missing. Resconi's aim is to check the position of each text in Avallé's overall stemma of the troubadour manuscript tradition. Personally, I have some doubts as to whether Avallé's method is entirely error-free and would agree with William Paden (1995) when he argues that the Neolachmannian hypothesis fails to take into account oral delivery in the early stages of the transmission of troubadour poetry. Resconi's frequent references to contamination would seem to lead to similar conclusions, and in the end he does go some way to demolishing Avallé's stemma from the inside, as it were. Avallé aligns U to PSc as part of the «terza tradizione», a group of manuscripts that seem to have been put together to facilitate the «Neolachmannian hypothesis». Resconi concludes that the «terza tradizione» probably does not exist and would seem instead to belong to Avallé's *y* branch, which includes the great 'native' songbooks C and R. He agrees with Varvaro's view that *y* represents a more «active» tradition compared to the *ε* branch of manuscripts from the Veneto, which is more «quiescent» (p. 171). Indeed, the Veneto branch has all the features of a written, more philological tradition to which the Neolachmannian methodology may be applied, compared to *y*, which basically contains all the other songbooks and, as Paden suggests, displays the influence of oral transmission or, in Resconi's words «[i] derivati di *y* [sono] inseriti in una fitta rete di contatti oscillatori in lezioni non sempre del medesimo valore, che tendono a isolarli dal ramo concorrente normalmente costituito dalla tradizione veneta» (p. 171). Thus, U, though an Italian manuscript, stands as an Italian exponent of *y* like P, and just like this latter manuscript, hails from Tuscany.

This conclusion is reached in the excellent examination of the different linguistic strata present in the songbook (ps. 185-266), which takes into account the primary Occitan layer, the secondary Italian layer looking for north-eastern forms, including a very useful comparison with Franco-Italian texts, as well as Tuscan forms: double consonants, *raddoppiamento fonosintattico*, Tuscan diphthongs, etc. A further, stimulating part of the discussion is Resconi's analysis of what he terms the «image» of the language possessed by the scribes, which accounts for the lack of highly marked forms alongside *lectiones faciliores*, as the scribe sought to cater to the audience's linguistic horizon of expectations (ps. 188-190). The language points to Florence as the place where the manuscript was copied, but the presence of west Tuscan features hints at a passage through the Pisa-Lucca area (p. 205). This, along with the manuscript's makeup (p. 267), suggests that its predecessors may have reached Tuscany through Genoa from Monferrato and Piedmont. This is an important inference given that we too often privilege the Veneto 'route', overlooking the importance of the links between Provence and Liguria and/or Piedmont, which are now emerging as fundamental in the formation of the Italian tradition, as witnessed by the recent discovery of a translation of Giraut de Bornelh's *alba*, *Reis glorios*, in a north-western variety (BERTOLETTI 2014; DI GIROLAMO 2015). U, moreover, is a *Guirautssammlung* (though it does not contain the *alba*).

Moving from this latter point, I would also say that the final section (ps. 267-322) of Resconi's work is most significant where he examines the rationale behind the compilation: mostly *cansos* or poems perceived as such, with a final, unstructured section containing some compositions by Italian authors and a *coda* devoted to Bertran de Born. Anthologies of the troubadours represent a process of selection, an example of the tastes of new audiences and patrons. In this sense, U reveals similarities with what Kay observes in her study of quotations: it prefers the *canso*, avoids *clus* poetry apart from Arnaut Daniel (and one song by Raimbaut d'Aurenga) and archaic poets, except for one song by Jaufre Rudel, to be interpreted as «archaeology» (p. 274). Resconi shows how the canon exemplified by *Chansonnier* U includes all the poets quoted by Dante, and seven of the eleven poems present in *De vulgari eloquentia*. The manuscript also contains songs rewritten by Tuscan poets, as well as, in its *mise en page*, a tendency to copy short lines together as though they were longer lines, just as Dante considers Giraut's *Er auziretz / enchabalitz chantars*, the opening song in U, to be composed in hendecasyllables. U, then, stands as a Tuscan selection for a specifically Tuscan audience, made at a time when an Italian tradition had already begun. Consequently, this book, though primarily intended as a study in material philology, is actually much more and illustrates, along with the other two volumes reviewed here, how the areas on both sides of Occitania, Catalonia and Italy, preserved the poetry of the troubadours not only by giving shelter to the *faidits* in the aftermath of the Albigensian crusade, but also by adopting, reworking and renewing this poetry, thus continuing the tradition.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- BERTOLETTI (2014): Nello Bertolletti, *Un'antica versione italiana dell'alba di Giraut de Bornel*, Rome: Edizioni di Storia e Letteratura.
- DI GIROLAMO (2015): Costanzo Di Girolamo, «L'alba ambrosiana», *Medioevo romanzo*, 39, ps. 404-418.
- KAY (2013): Sarah Kay, *Parrots and Nightingales. Troubadour Quotations and the Development of European Poetry*, Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.
- PADEN (1995): William D. Paden, «Manuscripts», F. R. P. Akehurst and Judith M. Davis, *A Handbook of the Troubadours*, Berkeley - Los Angeles - London: University of California Press, ps. 307-333.

Estudis Medievals en Homenatge a Curt Wittlin

PHILIP D. RASICO

Vanderbilt University (Nashville, Tennessee, EUA)
philip.d.rasico@vanderbilt.edu

- BADIA, CASANOVA & HAUF (2015): Lola Badia, Emili Casanova i Albert Hauf (eds.), *Studia Mediaevalia Curt Wittlin Dicata / Mediaeval Studies in Honour [of] Curt Wittlin / Estudis Medievals en Homenatge a Curt Wittlin*, Alacant: Institut Interuniversitari de Filologia Valenciana; «Symposia Philologica», 25.

Amb aquesta miscel·lània d'estudis tant els editors com els autors dels treballs que constitueixen el volum han volgut retre homenatge a un dels més distingits i més prolífics romanistes de la segona meitat del segle *xx* i de la primera dècada del *xxi*, la investigació del qual està enfocada principalment en temes literaris, lingüístics i culturals medievals corresponents a les terres de llengua catalana peninsulars.

Curt J. Wittlin (Reinach, Suïssa 1941), el nom del qual s'escrivia Kurt anteriorment a la seva emigració a l'Amèrica del Nord l'any 1965, el mateix any en què va doctorar-se a la Universitat de Basilea en filologia iberoromànica, lingüística francesa i literatura italiana amb una tesi, dirigida per Germà Colón, sobre la traducció catalana realitzada per Guillem de Copons del *Libre del tresor* de Brunetto Latini. A l'Amèrica del Nord Wittlin va iniciar la seva carrera docent als Estats Units, i concretament a Union College, situat a l'estat de Kentucky, on va treballar durant un parell d'anys abans d'incorporar-se el 1967 a la facultat de lletres de la Universitat de Saskatchewan (Saskatoon, Saskatchewan, Canadà). Seria en aquesta universitat canadenca on Wittlin desenvoluparia la major part de